

Durham E-Theses

The logical possibility of time travel.

Ney, Sharon Elizabeth

How to cite:

Ney, Sharon Elizabeth (1993) The logical possibility of time travel., Durham theses, Durham University. Available at Durham E-Theses Online: http://etheses.dur.ac.uk/1025/

Use policy

 $The full-text\ may\ be\ used\ and/or\ reproduced,\ and\ given\ to\ third\ parties\ in\ any\ format\ or\ medium,\ without\ prior\ permission\ or\ charge,\ for\ personal\ research\ or\ study,\ educational,\ or\ not-for-profit\ purposes\ provided\ that:$

- a full bibliographic reference is made to the original source
- a link is made to the metadata record in Durham E-Theses
- the full-text is not changed in any way

The full-text must not be sold in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holders.

Please consult the full Durham E-Theses policy for further details.

Academic Support Office, The Palatine Centre, Durham University, Stockton Road, Durham, DH1 3LE e-mail: e-theses.admin@durham.ac.uk Tel: +44 0191 334 6107 http://etheses.dur.ac.uk The copyright of this thesis rests with the author. No quotation from it should be published without his prior written consent and information derived from it should be acknowledged.

•

٩

THE LOGICAL POSSIBILITY OF TIME TRAVEL

2 VOLUMES (VOLUME 2)

SHARON ELIZABETH NEY

PH.D.

UNIVERSITY OF DURHAM

PHILOSOPHY

1993



VOLUME CONTAINS CLEAR OVERLAYS

OVERLAYS SCANNED SEPERATELY AND OVER THE RELEVANT PAGE.

<u>Contents</u>

(Volume 2)

Chapter 6: Conclusions

-- 297

Bibliography

303

Diagrams

٠

•

297

<u>Chapter 6</u>

Conclusions

This thesis has covered a great many topics in order that it might qualify as a thorough analysis of the popular system of time travel. It would therefore be of use to

briefly summarise the nature of each subject's contribution to this conclusion.

The introduction of the personal/external time frame distinction was necessary both to resolve the most immediate and obvious contradiction attributed to time travel, and to ensure that information regarding future origins could be preserved during a journey into the past. A system of identity was then specified that could accommodate for the

peculiar circumstances of a time traveller entering his own

causal past, enabling him to exist before his birth relative to the external time frame, and to communicate with himself should the need arise (a common feature of science fiction novels concerned with time travel). The problems of freewill and determinism introduced two distinctions that have been built on in the chapter on causality: one between the number of occurrences of a given particular event (i.e. one) and the number of experiences possible of that event using a

time machine (as many as will fit into a lifetime); the

other between a necessary condition and a sufficient

condition for determining causal relations. It was shown

that time travel need not be incommensurate with freedom of

will, but a certain intuitive discomfort led to the

consideration of possible worlds. The nature of causal relations between a traveller interfering in the past, and

an earlier person-stage existing in the external future

relative to that event, were examined, and it was shown that

the logical possibility of time travel depended on a

breakdown of the causal chain generated by his initial

arrival in the past: if the traveller can exist in the past

without any causal consequences propagating to an earlier

person stage lying in the future, time travel as defined is

possible; if, on the other hand, it is a matter of fact that

one cannot transmit information, in any form, into the past

within one possible world without the generation of closed

causal chains, then time travel cannot occur. This is

because it will engender a logical contradiction in which

any given event will occur once relative to the external time frame but an infinite number of times relative to the personal time frame in the same external space-time position.

Time travel within one world revealed a need for a 'higher' time dimension in order to accommodate for sequences of events whose origins lie in the future. It was indicated that possible worlds might also require additional time frames (with the potential for infinite regress), and

associated with this was the question of proving that time

travel itself -- and not just inter-world travel -- had

occurred. A further consequence was the high improbability

' of a time traveller ever reappearing in his world of origin

at any moment after his departure (external time), and the concomitant problems of proving time travel, or even interworld travel, as opposed to the mere destruction of the traveller under such circumstances. Finally, an examination of relative time travel within one possible world proved to

be restricted by the same logical and probabilistic

constraints as had been previously encountered. From these

results it was concluded that the popular system of time

travel is at best highly improbable and, depending on the

nature of causal relations, logically impossible, while the

introduction of a system of possible worlds to resolve these

problems requires the assumption of ever more dubious

qualifications that must be resolved before such a

'solution' may be considered practical.

In the course of this thesis, however, considerably more has been achieved than the bare answer to the question posed in the Introduction. Through the manipulation of the temporal direction experienced by a hypothetical character there has been revealed the fundamental importance of an asymmetrical 'arrow of time' to our perception of our own identity, our assumptions about the nature of freedom, and our understanding of causal relations. While our inability to move through time leads us to refrain from including

references to our experience of it in our conversation and

thought, the fact of our experience has a powerful but

subtle effect on our theorising.

A great deal has also been revealed regarding the

subconscious assumptions of those who would claim time travel into the past is possible. 'Realism' about time is essential, as is the assumption of 'higher dimensions' as dictated by the requirements of the 'Myth of Passage'. This last image must be finally laid to rest if further

investigation into the nature of time is to make any

progress, but its pervasive influence (witness Gödel's

error) makes such a task considerably more complex than might be imagined.

The importance (and not just the fact) of those distinctions made between experience and occurrence, and between necessary and sufficient conditions for both freewill and causal relations has been highlighted. Once again, this study has indicated the propensity to assume,

rather than to test, the effect of time on our

understanding. It has often been suggested that time travel

would be possible if freewill were abandoned, but using

these distinctions it has been shown that there is no need

to abandon freewill, and that whether or not it is preserved

has no effect on the logical contradictions arising from the

generation of closed causal chains. Human choice cannot

affect whether or not a time traveller accidently crushes a

plant or insect whose existence is vital to the subsequent

structure of the world, nor can it hinder the absorption of

light or the respiratory processes, both of which are

necessary features of human existence, regardless of the

individual's temporal location (breathing apparatus might be

used, but if its presence were anachronistic it might create more problems than it solved).

David Lewis's claim that possible worlds must lack

spatio-temporal relations gained some measure of support

from the difficulties encountered in attempting to relate

different possible worlds in time and space, but generally

the concept of possible worlds fared poorly. This study has

helped to bring out the complexity of any attempt to analyse

concepts with which we can have no direct or indirect

contact -- the difficulties of providing a logical structure

becoming ever more complex as ad hoc solutions were provided

to the obstacles that arose.

As to the matter of further study, the nature of time, and its effect upon our thinking processes, is such that its

examination cannot be exhausted in a thesis of this size. What has been provided within these pages is an examination of the problems associated with one specific aspect of time, with a view to resolving one question. Further investigation into the interaction of time and metaphysical issues, and the importance of an asymmetrical arrow of time to human perceptions, will continue, but of all the concepts studied here, it is the nature of causal relations that have revealed themselves most in need of further investigation.

Such a study may also help to reveal the relationship

between time and causality, and the nature of time itself.

This thesis has shown that time has effects

incommensurate with claims that it is merely a concept

imposed by human beings, with no real substance or

,

existence: reverse causation, and any other process except

time, and while the world may appear strange to us --

violating all previously accepted probabilistic norms -- it

will not lead to contradictions; reverse time and every

other process, such that a person or object only ever

reveals information appropriate to his or its temporal

position, and ceases to exist when it should become

necessary, and, once again, no contradictions will be

generated; but reverse our passage through time while

preserving information regarding our temporal origins, by

keeping the causal passage positively ordered with respect

to the person travelling, and very real problems develop.

Time and the temporal order are neither unreal nor

arbitrary, but their true nature remains to be determined.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Allen, B. and Simon, J., 'Time Travel on a String', Nature,

Vol. 357, 7 May 1992, pp. 19-21.

Almond, B., The Philosophical Quest, London, Penguin Books,

1988.

Arntzenius, F., 'Causal Paradoxes and Special Relativity', British Journal for the Philosophy of Science Vol. 41, 1990, pp. 223-243.

Augustine, Confessions, (trans. R.S. Pine-Coffin) Harmondsworth, Middlesex, Penguin Classics, 1961.

Ayer, Sir A.J., 'Freedom and Necessity', in Watson (ed.), 1986, pp. 15-23.

Ayer, Sir A.J., The Problem of Knowledge, Harmondsworth, Middlesex, Penguin Books Ltd, 1964.

Benford, G.A., Book, D.L., Newcomb, W.A., 'The Tachyonic Antitelephone', Physical Review D2, 1970, pp. 263-265. Bigelow, J., 'Worlds Enough for Time', Nous, Vol. XXV, No. 7, March 1991, pp. 1-20.

Boethius, The Consolation of Philosophy, (trans. V. Watts)

Harmondsworth, Middlesex, Penguin Books, 1987.

Book, D.L., see Benford, G.A.

Born, M., Einstein's Theory of Relativity, New York, Dover Publications, Inc., 1962.

Bradbury, R., 'A Sound of Thunder', in The Golden Apples of the Sun, London, Grafton HarperCollins, 1977.

Brody, B.A., Identity and Essence, Princeton, Princeton

University Press, 1980.

Brown, B., 'Defending Backwards Causation', Canadian Journal of Philosophy Vol. 22, No. 4, December, 1992. pp. 429-444.

Cleugh, M.F., Time, And Its Importance in Modern Thought (Ph.D. thesis), London, Methuen and Co. Ltd, 1937.

Cook, M., 'Tips for Time Travel' in N. Smith (ed.), 1982.

Coveney, P. and Highfield, R., The Arrow of Time, London, Flamingo, 1991.

Craig, W.L., 'Tachyons, Time Travel and Divine Omniscience', The Journal of Philosophy, Vol. LXXXV, No. 3, March 88, pp. 135-150.

Deser, S. and Jackiw, R., 'Time Travel'. Extended version of talk presented at '46 LNS 46, Cambridge, Massachusetts,

May 1992 (pre-publication circular).

Donne, J., Devotions, Abbey Classics, Simpkin, Marshall

Hamilton, Kent and Co. Ltd, 1925.

Dozois, G. (ed), Time Travellers, New York, Ace Books, 1989.

Dummett, M., 'Bringing about the Past' in Gale (ed), 1968,

pp. 252-274. Originally in The Philosophical Review No. 73, 1964.

Dummett, M., 'Causal Loops' in Flood and Lockwood (eds), 1986.

Dummett, M., 'Can an Effect Precede its Cause?' Truth and Other Enigmas, London, Duckworth, 1978, pp. 319-332.

Dunne, J.W., An Experiment with Time, London, Faber and Faber Ltd, 1969.

Earman, J., 'Implications of Causal Propagation outside the Null Cone', Australasian Journal of Philosophy, Vol. L,

1972, pp. 223-237.

Earman, J., World Enough and Space-Time, Cambridge,

Massachusetts/London, England, A Bradford Book, The MIT

Press, 1989.

Ehring, D., 'Personal Identity and Time Travel', Philosophical Studies Vol. 52, 1987, pp. 427-433.

Ehring, D., 'Survival and Trivial Facts', Analysis Vol 47,

No. 1, Jan. 1987, pp. 50-54.

Einstein, A., 'Reply to Criticism' in Schilpp (ed.), 1949.

Elliot, R., 'How to Travel Faster Than Light?', Analysis,

Vol 41, No. 1 (New Series. No. 189), January, 1981, pp. 4-6.

Elliot, R., 'Personal Identity and the Causal Continuity Requirement', The Philosophical Quarterly Vol. 41, No.

162, January, 1991, pp. 55-75.

Elliot, R. & Gallois, A., 'Would it Have Been Me?', Australasian Journal of Philosophy Vol. 62, No. 3, September, 1984.

Fitzgerald, P., 'On Retrocausality', Philosophia, IV, 1974, pp. 513-551.

Fitzgerald, E. (translator), Rubaiyat of Omar Khayyam,

London, Macmillan and Co., 1859.

Flew, A., 'Time Travel and the Paranormal', Philosophy Vol. 63, 1988, pp. 266-268.

Flood, R and Lockwood, M, (eds), The Nature of Time, Oxford, Basil Blackwell, 1986.

Freeman, E and Sellars, W, (eds), The Philosophy of Time, Lasalle Illinois, Open Court, 1971.

Gale, R.M., 'Why a Cause Cannot be Later than its Effect',

Review of Metaphysics No. 19, (1965), pp. 209-234.

Gale, R.M., The Philosophy of Time, London, Macmillan, 1968.

Gale, R.M., ""Here" and "Now"', in Freeman and Sellars

٠

307

(eds), 1971.

1

Gallois, A., see Elliot, R.

Gamow, G., Mr Tompkins in Wonderland, Cambridge, Cambridge

University Press, 1939.

Gardner, M., 'Can Time go Backward?', Scientific American No. 77, January 1967.

Gardner, M., The Ambidextrous Universe, London, Penguin Books, 1982.

Gardner, M., Time Travel and other Mathematical

Bewilderments, New York, W.H. Freeman and Company, 1988.

Gödel, K., 'Relativity and Idealistic Philosophy', in Schilpp (ed.), 1949.

Gribbin, J., In Search of the Edge of Time, London, Transworld Publishers Ltd, 1993.

Harrison, J., 'Analysis Problem 18', Analysis 39:2, March, 1979, p. 65.

Harrison, J., 'Dr. Who and the Philosophers, or Time Travel

for Beginners', Aristotelian Society, Supplementary Volume XLV, 1971, pp. 1-24.

Harrison, J., 'Report on Analysis Problem 18', Analysis 40:2

March, 1980, pp. 65-73.

Hawking, S. W., and Ellis, G.F.R., The Large Scale Structure of Space-Time, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1973.

Hawking, S. W., 'The Chronology Protection Conjecture' (provided on request by the author), January, 1992.

Highfield, R., see Coveney, P.

Heinlein, R.A., 'All You Zombies', The Unpleasant Profession

of Jonathan Hoag, London, New English Library, 1980.

(First published 1959, Mercury Press Inc.)

Heinlein, R.A., 'By His Bootstraps', The Menace from Earth,

New York, Signet, 1959. (First published 1941, Street

and Smith Publications Inc.)

Holt, D.C., 'Time Travel: The Time Discrepancy Paradox', *Philosophical Investigations*, Volume 4, No. 4, 1981, pp. 1-15.

Horwich, P., Asymmetries in Time, London, A Bradford Book, The MIT Press, 1987.

Horwich, P., 'On Some Alleged Paradoxes of Time Travel', The

Journal of Philosophy, 72, 1975, pp. 432-444.

Jackiw, R., see Deser, S.

Kant, I., Critique of Pure Reason. Translated by Norman Kemp Smith, London, Macmillan Education Ltd (paperback

```
edition), 1989.
```

Kolak, D., and Martin, R., 'Personal Identity and Causality:

Becoming Unglued', American Philosophical Quarterly,

Vol. 24, No. 4, 1987, pp. 339-347.

Le Poidevin, R., Change, Cause and Contradiction, London, Macmillan, 1991.

Levison, A. B., 'Events and Time's Flow', Mind Vol. XCVI, No. 383, July 1987, pp. 341-353.

Lewis, C.S., The Dark Tower and Other Stories (fiction), ed. W. Hooper. London, William Collins & Co. Ltd, 1987.

Lewis, D., 'Counterpart Theory and Quantified Modal Logic',

Journal of Philosophy, Vol. 65, No. 5, March, 1968, pp. 113-126.

Lewis, D., 'Possible Worlds', in Loux (ed.), 1979.

Lewis, D., 'Survival and Identity', Philosophical Papers, Vol I, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1983.

Lewis, D., 'The Paradoxes of Time Travel' Philosophical

Papers, Vol II, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1986.

Lewis, D., 'Veridical Hallucination and Prosthetic Vision' &

'Postscript to "Veridical Hallucination and Prosthetic

Vision"' Philosophical Papers II, Oxford, Oxford

University Press, 1986.

Lewis, D., On The Plurality of Worlds, Oxford, Basil Blackwell, 1987.

Loux, M. J. (ed.) The Possible and the Actual, London, Cornell University Press, 1979.

Lowe, E. J., 'For Want of a Nail', Analysis 40.1, January 1980, pp. 50-52.

Lowe, E. J., 'Substance and Selfhood', Philosophy, 66, Jan. 1991, pp. 81-99.

Lycan, W., 'The Trouble with Possible Worlds', in Loux (ed.), 1979.

Lycan, W., Review of 'On The Plurality of Worlds', The

Journal of Philosophy Vol. LXXXV No. 1, Jan. 88, pp. 42-47.

MacBeath, M., 'Who was Dr. Who's Father?', Synthese 51, 1982, pp. 397-430.

Mackie, J. L., 'The Transitivity of Counterfactuals and

Causation', Analysis 40.1, 1980, pp. 53-54.

MacTaggart, J.M.E., 'Time', in Gale (ed), 1968, pp. 86-97.

Martin, R., see Kolak, D.

Mayo, B., 'The Open Future', in Gale (ed), 1968, pp. 175-291.

McCaffrey, A., Dragonflight (fiction), London, Corgi Books, 1969. (Tenth edition by Corgi, 1983. Original publisher Rapp & Whiting).

McCaffrey, A., The White Dragon (fiction), London, Corgi Books, 1979. (Seventh edition by Corgi, 1984. Original

publisher Sidgwick and Jackson).

McInerney, P.K., 'The Nature of a Person Stage', American Philosophical Quarterly Vol. 28, No. 3, July 1991, pp. 227-235.

Mellor, D.H., *Real Time*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1985.

Mellor, D.H., 'Causation and the Direction of Time',

Erkenntnis Vol. 35, Nos. 1-3, July 1991, pp. 191-203.

Minkowski, H., 'Space and Time', The Principle of

Relativity, London, Dover Publications Inc., 1923. (Reproduction edition.)

Moya, C.J., The Philosophy of Action, Oxford, Basil Blackwell, 1990.

Nerlich, G., 'Can Time be Finite?', Pacific Philosophical

Quarterly 62, 1981, pp. 227-239.

Newcomb, W.A., see Benford, G.A.

Newton-Smith, W.H., The Structure of Time, London, Routledge

and Kegan Paul, 1984 (first published 1980).

Nicholls, P. (ed), The Science in Science Fiction, London,

Roxby and Lindsey Press, 1982.

Oderberg, D.S., 'Some Problems of Identity over Time',

Cogito Vol. 5, No. 1, 1991, pp. 14-20.

Parfit, D., 'Personal Identity', Philosophical Review 80, 1971, pp. 3-27.

Parfit, D., Reasons and Persons, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1984.

Prior, A.N., 'Recent Advances in Tense Logic', in Freeman and Sellars (eds), 1971.

Putnam, H., 'It Ain't Necessarily So', Journal of Philosophy

Vol. 59, 1962, pp. 665 ff.

Quinton, A., 'Spaces and Times', Philosophy Vol. XXXVII, No. 140, April 1962, pp. 130-147.

Ray, C., Time, Space and Philosophy, London, Routledge, 1991.

Redmount, I., 'Wormholes, Time Travel and Quantum Gravity',

New Scientist No. 1714, 28 April, 1990, pp. 57-61.

Rescher, N., 'The Ontology of the Possible', in Loux (ed.), 1979.

Ridley, B.K., Time, Space and Things, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press (second edition), 1984.
Riggs, P.J., 'A Critique of Mellor's Argument against
"Backwards" Causation', British Journal for the

Philosophy of Science Vol. 42, 1991, pp. 75-86.

Robins, M.H., 'Deviant Causal Chains and Non-Basic Action', Australasian Journal of Philosophy Vol. 62, No. 3, September, 1984, pp. 265-282.

Rorty, A.O., The Identities of Persons, Berkeley, University of California Press, 1976.

Rosenberg, A., 'Is Lewis's 'Genuine Modal Realism' Magical Too?', Mind Vol XCVIII, No. 391, July 1989, pp. 411-

Schilpp, P., (ed) Albert Einstein: Philosopher Scientist,

Evanston and Chicago, Northwestern University, 1949.

Schlesinger, G.N, 'Possible Worlds and the Mystery of Existence', *Ratio* Vol. XXVI, June 1984, No. 1, pp. 1-18.

Sellars, W. See Freeman, E.

Shoemaker, S.S., 'Time Without Change', Identity, Cause and

Mind, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1984.

(Originally published in Journal Of Philosophy 66: 363-

381, 1969.)

Siderits, M., 'Ehring On Parfit's Relation-R', Analysis Vol. 48, 1988, pp. 29-32.

Silverberg, R., Sailing to Byzantium, in Dozois, G.

(Originally published in IAsfm, February, 1985.)

Sklar, L., Space, Time and Spacetime, London, University of California Press Ltd, 1974. (Paperback edition, 1977).

Smart, J.J.C., 'Causal Theories of Time', in Freeman and Sellars (eds), 1971.

Smart, J.J.C., 'Spatialising Time', in Gale (ed.), 1968.

Smith, N.D. (ed.) A Philosophers Look at Science-Fiction,

Chicago, Nelson-Hall, 1982.

Sorensen, R. A., 'Time-Travel, Parahistory and Hume', Philosophy Vol. 62, 1987, pp. 227-236.

Suppes, P., (ed.) Space, Time and Geometry, Dordrecht,

Holland/Boston U.S.A., Reidel Publishing Company, 1973.

Swinburne, R., Space and Time, London, Macmillan, 1968.

Taylor, R., 'Moving About in Time', The Philosophical Quarterly Vol. 9, No. 37, 1959, pp. 289-301.

Taylor, R., 'Spatial and Temporal Analogies and the Concept

of Identity', The Journal of Philosophy Vol. LII, No.

22, Oct. 1955, pp. 599-612.

Travis, J., 'Could a Pair of Cosmic Strings Open a Route Into the Past?', Science Vol. 256, 10 April, 1992.
Visses, M., 'Wormholes, Baby universes, and Causality', Physical Review D Vol. 41:4, 15 February, 1990, pp. 1116-1124.

Watson, G., Free Will, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1986.

Weiner, A., Klein's Machine, in Dozois, G. (Originally published in IAsfm, April, 1985.)

Weingard, R., 'On Travelling Backwards in Time', in Suppes

(ed.), 1973. (Originally published in Synthese 24, Nos.

1/2 (July August) 1972, pp. 117-132.)

Weir, S., 'Closed Time and Causal Loops: A Defense Against Mellor', Analysis Vol. 48, No. 4, Oct. 1988, pp. 203-209.

Wells, H.G., The Time Machine (fiction), (first published 1895), in H.G. Wells, The War Of The Worlds, The Invisible Man, The Time Machine, London, Octopus Books 1982.

Whitrow, G.J., The Natural Philosophy of Time, Oxford,

Clarendon Press, second edition, 1980.

Wilkes, K.V., Real People, Personal Identity Without Thought Experiments, Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1988. Williams, D.C., 'The Myth of Passage', in Gale (ed.), 1968, pp. 98-117.

Wolf, F.A., Parallel Universes, London, The Bodley Head Ltd, 1990.

Zwart, P.J., 'The Flow of Time', in Suppes (ed.), 1973.

The copyright of this thesis rests with the author. No quotation from it should be published without her prior written consent, and information derived from it should be acknowledged.

~

2

317



×,







·

. . .



٠

٠

Ŧ

× ... •



-

Arrows indicate direction of positive causal ordering





7

•

Χ.

•

•

•

,

۲



ł

ч ... ч ч



ł

1



•

•

Ţ





& Personal time

•

,

•

.

-

. . .





• ٠

.

-

. •

э.

•





Arrows indicate direction of positive causal ordering

.

•




τ**α**τι το τ Γ



.

••• •

•





•

x.

•

•

 \bullet



Arrows indicate direction of positive causal ordering



.

-

•

•

.

•

2.0







4

•

• • •



۳. . ۲



,

•

.

~

• • •

Arrows indicate direction of positive causal ordering

& Personal time

•



-



•



.

I I



3 ***** • •

-

-

•

Å Personal time

•

N

- y. .



2 🖓 ٠ ۲. r





....

,

•

-

-

•

•

-

-

å Personal time

.

•

J

•

•

~ ~

٠

•

• • • • • •



r ſ • •



•

f

4

•

-

....

.

1

-

-

.



.



•



T 1 m e	1
	1

·



м,

. . . .





 \bullet



& Personal time

4

Fig. 4.1

•

• -• • 1 ŀ



& Personal time

*



-



7

•

۹ ۱

1

•

1

F

Personal time



•





. . .







Lewisian Possible Worlds





 \sim

. .

•



~ **.**



•











Ļ

•

ł

j

ţ









W1 Begins backward time travel

Time




ŕ I



٠.



•







ţ



